



January 21, 2021

**President**

E. Toby Boyd

**Vice President**

David B. Goldberg

**Secretary-Treasurer**

Leslie S. Littman

**Board of Directors**

Greg Abt

Jesse Aguilar

Joe Bartell

Gayle Bilek

Greg Bonaccorsi

Denise Bradford

Christopher Bushée

Jerry Eaton

Robert Ellis

Margie Granado

Shelly Gupton

Mel House

Erika Lynn Jones

Sergio Martinez

Angela K. Normand

Mike Patterson

Roberto Rodriguez

Eva Ruiz

DeWayne Sheaffer

Telly S. Tse

**Executive Director**

Joe Boyd

TO: Yolanda Muñoz, Chair, Instructional Quality Commission  
Shanine Coats, Executive Director, Instructional Quality Commission

FROM: E. Toby Boyd, President, California Teachers Association

RE: Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

On behalf of the California Teachers Association (CTA), I am submitting comments and recommendations on the third draft of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum. CTA appreciates the California Department of Education's efforts to provide an Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum that educators can utilize in developing curriculum for the implementation of an Ethnic Studies course of study. We commend the department for their commitment and efforts to address the concerns of the stakeholders and citizens in this diverse state and their desires to ensure their histories and experiences are seen and heard.

This model curriculum, being the first in the nation, also needs to be one that California teachers can use meaningfully, intentionally, and effectively. Two of CTA's policymaking committees, Curriculum and Instruction and Civil Rights in Education, held several deep and exhaustive webinar meetings to review the model curriculum. These are practitioners from the field who are potential users of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum. The remainder of the comments and recommendations reflects our practitioners' review of the guide.

This third draft of the model curriculum clarifies that the document is a guide and not a curriculum. While this clarifies the focus of the guide, our practitioners are concerned that there is insufficient guidance for educators to develop an Ethnic Studies curriculum, especially if they have never taught an Ethnic Studies course. The guide seems to teeter on a multicultural perspective tied to the more Eurocentric focus of the History Social Studies Framework rather than an Ethnic Studies perspective. As such, the "Eight Outcomes of Ethnic Studies Teaching" have no history in Ethnic Studies teaching and learning, research, or pedagogy. We recommend the deletion of the Eight Outcomes but keep the "Guiding Values and Principles of Ethnic Studies" which are the core values that should be instilled in a strength-based Ethnic Studies course. To be consistent, where the document only list six guiding principles, there are actually seven. We recommend including the seventh principle:

Conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for post-imperial life that promote collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and radical healing.

Although the guide is more focused on developing a course that meets the A-G admissions requirement of the University of California, there was only a slight mention of TK-8 with very little guidance of a curriculum. Our practitioners felt that incorporating Ethnic Studies into a K-8 curriculum takes more guidance and planning. We recommend that ample templates, course development, curriculum planning, and lessons be developed around the guiding principles for TK-8. The IQC would be providing a tremendous resource if the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum encompasses all grade levels. It would be a more robust and acclaimed national debut of an Ethnic Studies guide if it was a TK-12 guide. We wholeheartedly recommend a universal TK-12 curriculum that provides pedagogy and guidelines for developing critical thinking skills in read alouds, questioning, repeating facts, and modeling at the primary level and progressing to diving deeper into the text, comparing, contrasting, analyzing, and showing evidence spiraling all the way up to the secondary level. The IQC would do well by ensuring that a model curriculum is built on the platform of the Common Core State Standards, literacy, inquiry, and the Depth of Knowledge using Ethnic Studies guiding principles and content.

While we feel that a “how to” guide for school districts was accomplished in Chapter 2, we feel that Chapter 3 on Instructional Guidance has shortchanged the educators who would be teaching the course. Chapter 3 continues with the “what” for teachers, but it is missing the vignettes and samples that teachers are used to seeing in the frameworks that show them “how to” or lets them “see” what a lesson looks like. We recommend strengthening Chapter 3 with more examples of the stand alone or thematic models. Adding templates or examples demonstrates what it looks like to apply a concept or a theme for teachers to see. Since our practitioners have been experiencing online teaching, they are very interested in seeing the department take a step forward into the virtual world by using “how to” videos to show the functionality of the templates or examples. Imagine including a bar code or QR code embedded in the document for quick and easy access to videos demonstrating sample lessons. This will take the first national curriculum for Ethnic Studies to the next level.

We also have some organizational or layout recommendations for the third draft. The bibliography in Chapter 4 seems out of place. We recommend that the bibliography be the last appendix in the guide. We also noticed the references are old and outdated, and we recommend that more recent scholars and thinkers be added. Another recommendation in the bibliography or reference section is to make sure that the guide provides resources to comply with the Fair, Accurate, Inclusive, and Respectful Education Act or the F.A.I.R. Education Act (Senate Bill 48, Leno) which requires the inclusion of the political, economic, and social contributions of persons of color with disabilities and lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender people into the model curriculum. The F.A.I.R. Act ensures that the historical contributions of people of color, lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender people are accurately and fairly portrayed in instructional materials.

We also suggest that the IQC take a closer look at the essential questions to ensure that these questions promote robust thinking and application of concepts and content. We recommend that to effectively use the inquiry model, the essential questions for the

sample lessons involve a greater application of the depth of knowledge progression so that students are not just surface learning and regurgitating the facts. We want our students to be able to analyze what they have read and provide evidence to argue and defend their points and ideas.

Lastly, I am reminded of the comments that the Superintendent of Public Instruction made about revising rather than rewriting the proposed first draft of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum. The team that wrote the second draft totally dismissed the work and contribution of the original advisory committee. These are the practitioners that had the experience in teaching Ethnic Studies. Their dedication and commitment in developing a model Ethnic Studies curriculum have been diminished. CTA has long been on record that advisory committee members, being the original writers of the model curriculum, need to be included in the revision work being conducted by the CDE staff. We urge you to consider their valuable input in finalizing the revisions. CTA remains committed to a fair and transparent representation of teacher and student voices in the development of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

In summary, CTA supports a vibrant and robust Ethnic Studies curriculum and believes educator and student participation in Ethnic Studies have positive effects on their personal and professional growth and leads to overall achievement of all students. The positive benefits include widening cultural awareness and strengthening knowledge of the foundational ideals of equality upon which democracy is built. We support effective ongoing training programs for the purpose of recognizing and eliminating discrimination in the educational setting and endorse positive action plans that establish procedures and a timetable for eliminating discrimination in the curriculum. For that reason, the final point that we strongly emphasize is that this guide needs to promote ongoing relevant professional development to ensure that educators teach Ethnic Studies with a strength-based mindset that embodies the core values and principles of Ethnic Studies.

We are providing Attachment A for a line-by-line recommendation and an Attachment B of a sample lesson on Gender Expansive History submitted by one of our practitioners. Thank you for your time in reviewing the comments from our practitioners. We appreciate all your diligence and dedication to the development of an Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.

ETB/MF/jdh

c: David Goldberg, Vice President  
Leslie S. Littman, Secretary-Treasurer  
CTA Board of Directors  
Becky Zoglman, Associate Executive Director, TID  
Norma Sanchez, Manager, IPD/IFT

Attachment A:

CTA's Addendum Regarding Recommendations on the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

| Chapter | Page | Line(s)    | Recommendations  |
|---------|------|------------|--|
| Preface | 3    | 19         | Tolteka's name should be correctly noted as "R. Tolteka Cuauhtin".   |
| Preface | 3    | 28         | If you count petition signers, that number increases to over 50,000 individuals.   |
| Preface | 4    | Footnote 1 | At the end of Footnote 1, change the date from 2018 to 2019.   |
| Preface | 4    | 47         | We noticed that first letter of Ethnic Studies is in lower case in some sections, upper case in others, and upper and lower case in others. It should be consistently applied throughout the document as, "Ethnic Studies".  |
| Preface | 5    | 55-56      | Add after "representation from", "native peoples of the land where any course is taught, and the racial/ethnic..."   |
| Preface | 5    | 70         | Add "and the teacher on record" after "local education agencies" and define how much flexibility is provided.  |
| Preface | 5    | 75-77      | The phrase shall read "and other forms of bigotry including, but not limited to, anti-Blackness, anti-indigeneity, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and Islamophobia". Bigotry is much more widespread.   |
| Preface | 5    | 78-80      | Add a footnote citation on where the 4 sample themes came from and show their connection to the Ethnic Studies Guiding Principles.   |
| Preface | 6    | 89         | Delete "proposed".   |
| One     | 3    | 19-51      | Begin the introduction section entitled, "Why Teach Ethnic Studies" with elevating the voices of Students of Color who have advocated for Ethnic Studies. It should also draw upon the 52 years of Ethnic Studies expertise, methods, theories, and pedagogy. Teaching Ethnic Studies empowers our communities by teaching the truth and engaging them in social change. |
| One     | 3    | 29-32      | We recommend adding two additional "things" that Ethnic Studies should simultaneously do:<br>(4) critiquing systems of power   |

|     |   |         |  |
|-----|---|---------|--|
|     |   |         | (5) moving students to take action and engage civically  |
| One | 4 | 59-76   | <p>Use the definition from the experts, not from the H/SS Framework. The definition we recommend is from the Liberated Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Coalition:</p> <p>“Ethnic Studies is the interdisciplinary field that encompasses Africana/Black/African American Studies, American Indian/Alaskan Native/Native American Studies, Asian American/Pacific Islander Studies, Arab American Studies, and Chicanx/Latinx Studies. These disciplines contend with racism, white supremacy, and nation within nation relationships. By centering the stories, experiences, and perspectives of the aforementioned groups, intertribal, and mixed race people, Ethnic Studies uses community epistemologies, content, and pedagogy to educate students to be socially, politically, environmentally and economically conscious of their personal connections to local and (trans)national histories and herstories.”</p> <p>“Students in these courses study imperialism, coloniality, oppression, hegemony, privilege, and power--through the intersectional lenses of race, ethnicity, culture, gender, sexuality, ability, language, indigeneity, immigrant status, and class. We analyze systems of power through engagement with anti-racist, social justice activism as a means towards sovereignty, self-determination, and/or community actualization. Reflection, naming, dialogue, and community responsive action drive the learning, and support the belief that each person has important narratives, stories, and voices to share. Students will have the opportunity to cultivate intersectional solidarity with groups of people, locally and (trans)nationally, to foster active community responsiveness, social engagement, radical healing, critical hope and love, and a reimagined future.”</p> |
| One | 8 | 169-171 | Delete this sentence. Repetitive.  |
| One | 9 | 182     | Add the Tucson story after “education” in Line 182. “At the K-12 level, the successful Tucson Ethnic Studies (Mexican American Studies program) was banned in Arizona in 2010 per the passage HB2281   |

|     |       |         |   |
|-----|-------|---------|---|
|     |       |         | legislation, a ban later ruled unconstitutional and based on racial animus in a court of appeals. In the following 10 years from 2011-2020.”  |
| One | 9     | 182     | Delete “Over the last 10 years,”. Start the sentence with “This…”   |
| One | 11    | 234     | Insert “racially” before “marginalized groups” and add “including their intersectionality” after. The phrase should read: “racially marginalized groups including their intersectionality”.   |
| One | 11    | 238     | Add “humanizing” before “opinions”.   |
| One | 12    | 243     | Add “humanizing” before “conclusions”.  |
| One | 12-13 | 253-271 | The Guiding Values are the heart of teaching Ethnic Studies, and it seems as if Guiding Value #7 is missing from this context. We recommend that Guiding Value #7 be added:<br><br>7. Conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for post-imperial life that promote collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and radical healing.             |
| One | 13    | 275-387 | Regarding the 8 Outcomes of Ethnic Studies Teaching, these are desirable outcome for a multicultural curriculum, not Ethnic Studies. We recommend that there be less emphasis on the 8 Outcomes or delete them, and we recommend that the emphasis be placed on the Guiding Values and Principles of Ethnic Studies for a more coherent strength based outcome for Ethnic Studies |
| One | 13    | 278     | Change “different” to “horrific or dehumanizing”.   |
| One | 13    | 280     | Change “nuance” to “intentionality”. Delete “drawing from multiple perspectives.”   |
| One | 14    | 285     | Change “inclusivity” to “access”. Rationale: You could be included but not have access.   |
| One | 14    | 292     | Change “being inclusive of” to “giving voice and agency to”   |
| One | 14    | 299     | Add to title: “and Better Understanding of Others”.   |
| One | 15    | 314     | Add after “divorce”, “legal status”.  |
| One | 15    | 328     | Add after “an”, “awareness”.  |

|     |    |       |  |
|-----|----|-------|--|
|     |    |       |  |
| One | 18 | 394   | Delete “modify their positions” to “value and respect each other’s position in light of new evidence”.   |
| 2   | 3  | 20    | We suggest that “thematic approach” be defined and site several examples of what might constitute a theme such as Identity, Systems of Power, Genocide, Voting Rights, or Social Movements.  |
| 2   | 3  | 25    | “Develop a definition of what ethnic studies mean to your district” sounds misleading. It implies that districts should create their own definition of Ethnic Studies. We suggest that the caption be rewritten to: “Develop a purpose statement that explains the significance of Ethnic Studies for the district that is grounded in the core tenets of the discipline.” |
| 2   | 3  | 28    | Add after ‘study’, “and the Guiding Values and Principles of Ethnic Studies in this curriculum include many of the core tenets of Ethnic Studies as a discipline”.   |
| 2   | 3  | 29    | We recommend that this bullet be more specific about defining community needs. Add questions like, what is the history of race relations in this community? How has demographic or economic changes impacted the community, e.g. changing from a majority white community to majority minority? Is there a vibrant ethnic community, past or present?                      |
| 2   | 3  | 33    | Delete “incorporate”, and “to be based in”.  |
| 2   | 3  | 34    | Add after Ethnic Studies, “or will it become its own department”?  |
| 2   | 3  | 34    | Delete “separate”.   |
| 2   | 4  | 41    | In this bullet, we recommend that community organizations, city or county agencies, and universities be included as groups to consult for data and historical information about a community.   |
| 2   | 4  | 45-48 | This section implies that Ethnic Studies should only be tailored to ELs and students living in poverty. It does not mention how white, affluent students would benefit. After “students living in poverty”, add “likewise, what can white or Anglo students learn from an Ethnic Studies course. How can Ethnic Studies program serve all students?”                       |

|   |    |         |   |
|---|----|---------|---|
| 2 | 4  | 55      | In this bullet, specific sources of funding should be recommended. We recommend that districts look to funds from the LCFF/LCAP, Title I, Title II, or Title III funds. Additional federal entitlement funds could be targeted for an Ethnic Studies curriculum.  |
| 2 | 5  | 93      | In this bullet, it is important to provide incentives to recruit Ethnic Studies educators. This section should include options for educators to take college or university ethnic studies courses for continuing education. This section should also include incentives for districts to provide incentives for an advanced degree, additional certification, or credits to advance on the salary schedule. |
| 2 | 6  | 109     | Change the word “pipeline” to “cadre”. The word pipeline has a negative connotation as in school to prison pipeline.  |
| 2 | 7  | 125     | Add “Ethnic Studies experts” after “Consult with”.  |
| 2 | 6  | 110     | In this bullet, we recommend professional development needs to be defined as ongoing and recursive. It should not be a one shot and done type of PD. For Ethnic Studies to be successful, there needs to be ongoing reflection, deepening of thought, practicum, and sharing.   |
| 2 | 7  | 143     | Delete “using”, add “based on”.   |
| 2 | 8  | 181     | Add a sentence after “program”, “Administrators should also understand that Ethnic Studies has received pushback from outside communities of color since its inception, and thus it is important for administrators be prepared to defend the purpose and necessity of the course/program and its authentic anti-racist implementation, with much rationale found within this document”.                    |
| 2 | 11 | 250     | Delete “for elective courses such as”.  |
| 2 | 13 | 289-295 | Delete this paragraph. It is inaccurate and harmful on many levels.   |
| 3 | 4  | 52      | Add this last sentence at the end of Line 52: “Most importantly, Ethnic Studies empowers students to love themselves and their community”.  |
| 3 | 5  | 78-83   | This sentence implies that teachers with limited Ethnic Studies knowledge engage in activities to unpack their own identities, privilege, etc... We suggest a sentence or two should include some suggestions on how or where they could go about   |

|   |    |     |   |
|---|----|-----|---|
|   |    |     | gaining some insight and knowledge. We also recommend that teachers with limited knowledge of Ethnic Studies need to be advised on how to avoid the white savior complex and/or how to analyze it critically.   |
| 3 | 6  | 111 | After “human experience”, add a sentence about identity within a local community where individuals made significant contribution to the community. An example is the remarkable history about the contributions of Stockton native, Dawn Bohulano Mabalon, who contributed so much to preserving the history of the Pilipinos in Stockton. Her writings can help instill identity and pride in young people. Likewise, there are many of these types of community heroes.                                     |
| 3 | 7  | 136 | As a district implements Ethnic Studies, the type of data collection needs to be defined from the onset of implementation of the pilot. Otherwise, it is just collecting data for the sake of collecting data. What is necessary data to continue defining and improving the content of the course?   |
| 3 | 9  | 179 | Add in Line 179: ...frame a course description around <b>an essential</b> question like...  |
| 3 | 9  | 180 | Delete “and”, add after “time”, “and how do they relate to you, your ancestral legacy, and our world today?”  |
| 3 | 12 | 251 | Add a sentence, “And beyond traditional printed/digital texts, in Ethnic Studies literacies may be considered interdisciplinarily, multimodally and expansively – with students as multiliterate agents of change who “read the word and read the world”.   |
| 3 | 11 | 232 | We believe that students should also be exposed to literature text writing by BIPOC authors. We recommend that the next sentence in Line 232 be rewritten. “Not only should students learn the skills necessary to access informational, scholarly, and literary texts, they should also be exposed to literary texts from authors of color. Literary texts should be selected to tell the truth about Ethnic Studies and should not be watered down or ignore key components of history or literary genres”. |
| 3 | 13 | 289 | Add after “respected”, “while always keeping the course grounded in the humanizing anti-racist values and principles of Ethnic Studies;”  |

|   |       |         |  |
|---|-------|---------|--|
| 3 | 14    | 314     | Add after “learn”, “in working towards a more racially and socially just world”.   |
| 3 | 15-16 | 334-351 | This section is an overgeneralization on effectively engaging students. What is missing is instruction and guidance on how to engage students in critical thinking or analysis of the systems of power.  |
| 3 | 15    | 336     | “Sufficient” is a subjective term. In whose eyes is the term “sufficient”. We suggest deleting that word and start the sentence with “Understanding”.  |
| 3 | 16    | 349-351 | Rewrite this bullet: “While remaining grounded in the core humanizing anti-racist tenets of Ethnic Studies, careful attention to their own political viewpoints and potential biases and conformity with the status quo, to ensure students are empowered to understand the implicit influence of the dominant/master narrative in society, the value of historically marginalized voices, and to critically form their own opinions rather than simply adopting the views of the status quo, the teacher or particular educational materials -- which students may also elaborate, expand, and offer their own perspectives on.           |
| 3 | 17    | 372     | Add after “first”, conceived of as third world studies and formally founded as Ethnic Studies, it was and still...   |
| 3 | 17    | 388     | Adding a few more district efforts and experiences with implementing Ethnic Studies would be helpful. Besides San Francisco, we suggest LAUSD, San Diego Unified, and Compton Unified.   |
| 3 | 19-20 | 439-462 | This section on the Stand-Alone Course effectively reduced each of four ethnic groups that have traditionally been identified in an Ethnic Studies course from a chapter in the first draft to a section of approximately one page each is a “bleaching out” or “watering down” of the seriousness of the marginalization of each of these groups. The shorter sections with advice and considerations further marginalize each of the ethnic groups. We recommend that each ethnic group is given deeper consideration with a full chapter of examples of meaningful histories, culture, struggles, themes, and contributions to society. |
| 3 | 19    | 442     | Add after “demographics”, “poverty, geographic barriers such as redlining and urban blight”.   |
| 3 | 19    | 457     | Change “cover’ to “include”.   |

|   |       |         |   |
|---|-------|---------|---|
| 3 | 21    | 487&489 | There needs to be consistent application of lower or upper Black. We suggest that you capitalize the first letter of ethnic group names, e.g. Black or African American.  |
| 3 | 21    | 495     | Add a sentence at the end: "African American history and its importance is often overlooked or not mentioned in our history books, and it is important to trace and include the role of Black churches in the Civil Rights Movement, the Black Wall Street (Tulsa, OK), Reconstruction and Jim Crow. More importantly, those teaching Ethnic Studies should know about some of the voices who have lived through the movement."   |
| 3 | 21-22 | 496     | This section on Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x Studies lacks identification of historical figures who contributed to the movement. We recommend that relevant historical names and events be added to this section. We suggest less focus on terminology and more on content, such as, the violent colonization and oppression of Indigenous people and robbing and taking the land that belonged to the original Indigenous settlers of their land in the West and Southwest.  |
| 3 | 22    | 515&520 | Capitalize "Indigenous".  |
| 3 | 22    | 532     | Delete "the", insert "invasion of the Turtle Island/Abya Yala/the Americas, genocide and mestizaje, colonial independence"  |
| 2 | 22    | 538     | Change: "women" to "women/muxeres"  |
| 3 | 22-23 | 541-550 | The study of Asian American history and contributions need not be singled out to a particular subgroup or subfields as the guide suggests. Asian American studies is interrelated. We recommend deleting lines 516-522 and replacing it with the following: "Asian American Studies has its ties to the civil rights movement of the 1960s. Asian American and Pacific Islanders are composed of many interconnected groups and cultures in the Pacific rim, South and West Asia. There is a rich history of social activism that involves many nationalities as they immigrated to the United States and were marginalized and discriminated against when they arrived in this country. APIs from all nationalities have been excluded, discounted, mis-represented, blamed, and demonize. It is important to examine their lived experiences, their perspectives, and their |

|   |    |           |  |
|---|----|-----------|--|
|   |    |           | struggles and to feature the voices of Asian Americans within the communities where they live.”  |
| 3 | 23 | 566       | Add “Palestinians” after “Jews”. “Add “Dalits” after “Hindus”  |
| 3 | 24 | 577       | Add “Turtle Island/Abya Yala/ before “the Americas”.   |
| 3 | 24 | 572       | We recommend gathering input for this section from Native American educators who could provide knowledge and insight on the cultural ways of knowing and doing, theory and pedagogical concepts, and authentic culturally sustainable and relevant practices. Visibly absent are citations of significant historical figures or events that provide context to the Native American experiences of genocide, political identity, sovereignty, isolation, and marginalization.   |
| 3 | 24 | 589       | Add after “tribes”, “their survivance and continuance into the present and future.   |
| 3 | 24 | 598       | Add “Mni Wiconi Stand at Standing Rock to stop the” before “Dakota Access Pipeline”.   |
| 3 | 25 | After 598 | Add: (5) Grow strong relationships with the California Native American tribal nation(s) of the land where the course is being taught.  |
| 3 | 25 | 626       | After “providing”, add a curriculum focused on the 7 Guiding Principles of Ethnic Studies and a delete “a culturally proficient curriculum.” The guide should not give rise to cultural proficiency which is a goal of multi-cultural education and is not Ethnic Studies.   |
| 3 | 26 | 638       | After “stand alone unit” add “ or further integrated into the curriculum, adding balance through an ethnic studies lens.   |
| 3 | 26 | 642       | We suggest adding a sentence after A-G subject requirements in Line 642 to emphasize that the focus of the ESMC guide can be adjusted for a TK-8 focus: “Teachers wishing to include a TK-8 Ethnic Studies curriculum need to be cognizant of the pedagogical approach for developing curriculum to meet the needs at each grade level. A distinction needs to be made between multi-cultural education and Ethnic Studies when a teacher integrates Ethnic Studies into a TK-8 curriculum. Adjusting assignments, modes of assessment, and readings are most important to consider when adjusting the model |

|   |    |     |  |
|---|----|-----|--|
|   |    |     | curriculum to be developmentally appropriate for a specific grade level”.  |
| 3 | 27 | 662 | Add this sentence before Line 662, “Ethnic Studies, and this curriculum, also take bold steps forward in being the first state level curricula in the country, to honestly recognize genocide in the ancestral legacies of both Native Americans (including California Native Americans), and African Americans in what is termed the Maafa. |
| 3 | 28 | 696 | Add “Indigenous” after “among”. Add after “immigrant”, “(forced or voluntary)”.  |
| 3 | 28 | 703 | After “privilege”, add “and easier to reconnect to”.   |
| 3 | 29 | 719 | Add a footnote #13: the terms co-conspirators (e.g. see Bettina Love) and accomplices (e.g. see Indigenous Action Media) are also used in racial justice contexts, with important distinctions from allyship.  |
| 3 | 29 | 731 | After “competence”, add “in solidarity with each other as human beings and communities for a more racially and socially just and equitable world”.   |
| 3 | 30 | 749 | Add “Turtle Island/Abya Yala/” before “Americas.”  |
| 3 | 32 | 798 | Add the 7 <sup>th</sup> Guiding Principle.   |
| 3 | 32 | 809 | After “who”, add “are the original caretakers and”   |
| 3 | 36 | 904 | Add “along” after “considered”.  |
| 3 | 36 | 905 | Add after “Indigenous”, “members of the” before Latinx. Add after “United States”, “(such as the Zapotec, Maya, Nahuatl, Lenca, Quechua), which have”.   |
| 3 | 36 | 920 | Change “Middle East” to “Southwest Asia.”  |
| 3 | 36 | 923 | After “Genocide”, add “(2002)”   |
| 3 | 36 | 924 | Add a sentence: “It must be noted that this Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum builds upon that document by honestly and explicitly recognizing the impact of genocide in the ancestral legacies of both Native Americans, and African Americans (often referred to as the Maafa)”.   |
| 3 | 37 | 944 | Add after “for”, “ forced and voluntary”. After “immigrants”, add “and settler colonizers”. “  |
| 3 | 37 | 945 | Add after “promises”, “for some groups over other groups”.   |

|   |    |      |   |
|---|----|------|---|
| 3 | 40 | 1007 | Footnote 15 at the bottom of the page, change “the terms is believed to be of the Dakota dialect” to “the term is from the Dakota language”.  |
| 3 | 43 | 1047 | Add “(2016)” after “Schools”.   |
| 4 | 1  | 6    | <p>We suggest that the citations contain updated content and authors. Our suggested list of additional resources:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Center X at UCLA:<br/><a href="https://centerx.gseis.ucla.edu/xchange/ethnic-studies-k-12/introduction">https://centerx.gseis.ucla.edu/xchange/ethnic-studies-k-12/introduction</a></li> <li>• Wayne Au, Reclaiming the Multicultural Roots of U.S. Curriculum, 2016</li> <li>• Wayne Au, Critical Curriculum Studies Education, Consciousness, and the Politics of Knowing, 2012</li> <li>• Jocyl Sacramento, Critical Collective Consciousness: Ethnic Studies Teachers and Professional Development, 2019</li> <li>• Cati V. de los Rios, Picturing Ethnic Studies: Photovoice and Youth Literacies of Social Action, 2017</li> <li>• Yadira Pineda, Luchando Para Aprender: The Fight for Ethnic Studies in Compton, CA (dissertation), 2020</li> <li>• Michael Eric Dyson, Long Time Coming: Reckoning with Race in America, 2020</li> <li>• D. M. Sandoval, A. J. Ratcliff, T. L. Buenavista, &amp; J. R. Marin (Eds.), “White” washing American education: The new culture wars in ethnic studies. Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger, 2016.</li> </ul> |

| <p style="text-align: center;"><u><b>Gender Expansive Hxstory</b></u></p>   |
|---|
| <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Lesson Title: BIPOC Ancestral Gender Fluidity Around the World</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Grade Level(s): Elementary (may be adapted for middle/high school)</b></p>   |
| <p><b>Ethnic Studies Values and Principles Alignment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● <b>Cultivate</b> empathy, community actualization, cultural perpetuity, self-worth, self-determination, and the holistic well-being of all participants, especially Native People/s and People of Color.</li><li>● <b>Celebrate</b> and honor Native People/s of the land and Communities of Color by providing a space to share their stories of struggle and resistance along with their intellectual and cultural wealth.</li><li>● <b>Center</b> and place high value on pre-colonial, ancestral, indigenous, diasporic, familial, and marginalized knowledge.</li><li>● <b>Critique</b> empire, <b>white supremacy</b>, anti-blackness, <b>anti-indigeneity</b>, <b>racism</b>, xenophobia, <b>patriarchy</b>, <b>cisheteropatriarchy</b>, capitalism, ableism, anthropocentrism, and other forms of power and oppression at the intersections of our society.</li><li>● <b>Challenge</b> imperialist/colonial hegemonic beliefs and practices on ideological, institutional, interpersonal and internalized levels.</li></ul> |
| <p><b>Standards Alignment:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.4.1 (Refer to details and examples in a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text.)</li><li>● CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.4.2 (Determine the main idea of a text and explain how it is supported by key details; summarize the text.)</li><li>● CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.W.4.8 (Explain how an author uses reasons and evidence to support particular points in a text.)</li><li>● CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.W.4.7 (Interpret information presented visually, orally, or quantitatively (e.g., in charts, graphs, diagrams, time lines, animations, or interactive elements on Web pages) and explain how the information contributes to an understanding of the text in which it appears.)</li><li>● CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.SL.4.4 (Report on a topic or text, tell a story, or recount an experience in an organized manner, using appropriate facts and relevant, descriptive details to support main ideas or themes; speak clearly at an understandable pace.)</li></ul>                                     |
| <p><b>Lesson Purpose and Overview (1-2 Paragraphs Narrative Explanation)</b></p> <p>During this lesson, students will analyze non-fiction texts to understand beliefs and traditions surrounding gender fluidity in multiple Black, Indigenous, People of Color (BIPOC) LGBTQ+ ethnic</p>   |

communities around the world. Students will engage in meaningful conversations about the impact of colonialism on the gender fluidity of these BIPOC LGBTQ+ communities. Students will work in small groups (4-5 students in each group) to focus on learning about gender expansive peoples within one ethnic community. They will engage in dialogue to answer text-specific questions. Students are expected to take notes and present their findings to the class. As students are presenting, the class will be taking notes on each ethnic community's traditions and understandings of gender constructs. After all groups present, the class will engage in a conclusive dialogue where they begin to answer the essential questions: What is gender fluidity? How has colonialism affected gender fluidity in various ethnic communities around the world? How have these communities upheld their culture in the face of colonialism?

The following gender expansive ethnic communities are centered in this particular lesson; however, educators may add additional gender expansive ethnic communities or adjust the number of peoples, based upon their classroom size. These groups were chosen to signify the continental ancestral homelands of BIPOC communities, diverse representations of gender fluidity across these groups, and the continents they originate from:

- 1) **Zapotec** - Muxes (moōSHā)
- 2) **Lakota** - Winkte/Two-Spirit
- 3) **Native Hawi'ian** - Māhū
- 4) **Ethiopia** - Ashtime
- 5) **Kenya & Tanzania** - Mashoga
- 6) **Sulawesi, Indonesia** - Bissu
- 7) **Samoa** - Fa'afafine
- 8) **Thailand** - Kathoey

Educators may use the following slides to provide grade-level nonfiction text to each group. The [Student Information PPT](#) includes 8 ethnic communities. The first slide under each ethnic community has text-specific questions students will answer in their small groups. The second slide for each community has text for middle and high school students. The third slide for each community has text geared toward upper elementary students (4th-5th grades).

#### **Key Terms & Concepts (Ties into larger unit key terms may also include terms specific to the lesson)**

- Identity (should be pre-taught before this lesson)
- Gender (should be pre-taught before this lesson)
- Gender Fluidity
- Two Spirit
- Colonialism
- Transgender
- Winkte (Lakota)
- Mahu (Native Hawai'i)
- Ashtime (Ethiopia)
- Mashoga (Kenya/Tanzania)
- Bissu (Indonesia)

- Fa'afafine (Samoa)
- Kathoey (Thailand)

### Lesson Objectives

1. Students will be able to define gender fluidity.
2. Students will be able to relate gender fluidity to different BIPOC ethnic groups around the world.
3. Students will annotate and take notes on non-fiction texts.
4. Students will use information from non-fiction texts to answer important questions.
5. Students will work in groups to better understand the non-fiction text and answer questions relating to their reading.

### Essential Questions (Ties lesson to larger unit purpose)

What is gender fluidity?

How has colonialism affected gender fluidity in different ethnic communities around the world? How have these communities upheld their culture in the face of colonialism?

### Lesson Steps/Activities

1. Community Builder / Cultural Energizer (5-10 minutes)
  - Activating prior knowledge - Quick write
    - What does gender mean to you?
2. Direct Instruction (20 minutes)
  - Define new key terms: gender fluidity, colonialism, two spirit, Muxes, Mahu, Bissu,
  - Video: <https://www.bbc.com/news/av/world-53573764>
3. Small group research (30 minutes)
  - Students will be put into small groups to read a non-fiction text and answer questions relating to their assigned reading. In their groups, students will choose a role:
    - Readers (2-3 students)
    - Time keeper
    - Note taker
    - Presenter
  - Students are expected to present what they learned from the text to the rest of the class.
4. Conclusive Dialogue (student and community reflection)
  - Each group will present their information to the class. While each group is presenting, students will take notes on each ethnic community. They will have a graphic organizer with questions they need to answer for each ethnic community.
  - After all groups have presented, the class will engage in a community circle.
  - In the community circle, the teacher will facilitate by asking the questions: 1) What is gender fluidity? 2) How has colonialism affected gender fluidity in different ethnic communities around the world? 3) How have these communities upheld their culture in the face of colonialism?

### Application, Action, Assessment, and Reflection

- **Application:** Students will apply five of the guiding values and principles of ethnic studies (**cultivate, celebrate, center, critique, and challenge**) throughout all stages of the learning embedded within this lesson.
  - Specifically students will apply these values and principles in the following ways:
    - **Cultivate** empathy of gender expansive BIPOC communities across the world.
    - **Celebrate** and honor gender expansive Native People/s of the Land and Communities of Color by sharing their cultural wealth.
    - **Center** and place high value on pre-colonial, ancestral, indigenous, diasporic, familial, and marginalized knowledge of gender fluidity.
    - **Critique** empire, white supremacy, anti-Indigeneity, patriarchy, and cisheteropatriarchy.
    - **Challenge** imperialist/colonial hegemonic beliefs on the construction of gender.
  
- **Action:** Students will engage with multiple media sources provided by their teacher, to build an understanding of the meanings of key terms used throughout the lesson (for example, gender, gender fluidity, colonialism, transgender, two-spirit). Following this direct instruction, students will form groups in order to collaboratively research the traditions, culture and expressions of gender expansive people within an ethnic community. After research is concluded, students will present their knowledge to their peers, teaching each other about the multiple gender expansive peoples that were studied by the entire classroom community.
  
- **Assessment:** Students will be assessed on their presentation to the class on the gender expansive community they are studying in small groups.
  - Students will be expected to include the following components in their presentations:
    - Use appropriate facts and relevant, descriptive details to support in teaching the culture, traditions and expressions of a gender expansive BIPOC community to the whole class.
    - Relate gender fluidity to the group of people they are presenting on.
    - Discuss the impact that colonialism has had on gender expression within this community.
  
- **Reflection:** Students will take notes on the presentations of their peers, developing an understanding of each of the gender expansive peoples being taught about by classmates. In turn, students will respond to questions in a graphic organizer designated to help them order their learning with regards to all communities presented on. Following the presentations, the teacher will facilitate a community circle. Here students will have an opportunity to demonstrate their learning by answering the following questions:  
 1) What is gender fluidity? 2) How has colonialism affected gender fluidity in different ethnic communities around the world? 3) How have these communities upheld their culture in the face of colonialism?

**Materials and Resources:**

- Device with access to the internet (Chromebook, Macbook, Ipad, Desktop etc..)
- Student Information Powerpoint

-Graphic Organizer

-Age appropriate informational texts on each of the gender expansive communities included within this lesson.

### **Ethnic Studies Outcomes:**

Students will be able to connect gender beliefs and traditions to a variety of ethnic communities around the world. They will learn the importance of acceptance and gain an understanding of the BIPOC LGBTQ+ community. This lesson focuses on the intersectionality of identities. Students will strengthen their reading skills by analyzing non-fiction texts and pulling out important information for their audience. Students will also have the opportunity to practice their speaking skills through oral presentations.

### **Resources:**

<https://www.baaits.org/about>

<https://lgbtqhealth.ca/community/two-spirit.php>

<https://www.nps.gov/subjects/lgbtqheritage/upload/lgbtqtheme-nativeamerica.pdf> (p.5)

<https://www.refinery29.com/en-us/2017/11/181624/gender-fluid-examples-history>

<https://listverse.com/2015/10/21/10-examples-of-nonbinary-genders-throughout-history/>

[https://nonbinary.wiki/wiki/Gender-variant\\_identities\\_worldwide](https://nonbinary.wiki/wiki/Gender-variant_identities_worldwide)

<https://www.bbc.com/news/av/world-53573764>

[https://www.pbs.org/independentlens/content/two-spirits\\_map-html/](https://www.pbs.org/independentlens/content/two-spirits_map-html/)

<https://www.globalcitizen.org/en/content/third-gender-gay-rights-equality/>

<http://www.lgbtqhistory.org/lesson/native-americans-gender-roles-and-two-spirit-people/>

<https://www.pbs.org/independentlens/films/two-spirits/>

<https://www.lgbtqnation.com/2016/02/trans-history-101-transgender-expression-in-ancient-times/3/>

[https://www.redeemer-cincy.org/uploads/images/gender-diversity-in-indigenous-cultures\\_205.pdf](https://www.redeemer-cincy.org/uploads/images/gender-diversity-in-indigenous-cultures_205.pdf)

### **Optional Extension**

**In their groups, ask students to conduct further research on the gender expansive people they are studying, in order to find information answering the following question:**

How has their research connected to the lives, experiences, and movements of people in their own community?

**\*\*Application of the sixth guiding value, principle and outcome of ethnic studies:**

**Connect** ourselves to past and contemporary resistance movements for social justice on global and local levels to ensure a truer democracy.

Students can create multimodal presentations using visual slides, videos, photos, etc. and present them to the class in response to this extension question.

